



THE CATASTROPHIC MEMORY: FROM SILENCING TO THE PROCESS OF RESISTANCE THROUGH THE MEMORY REGISTER IN THERE THERE¹

Jennifer Santos de Oliveira²

ABSTRACT: This study proposes an approach to the concept of catastrophe within a corpus of literature written by indigenous authors. To do so, we use the work *There There*, by Tommy Orange (2018), a Native American belonging to the Cheyenne and Arapaho tribes of Oklahoma, in order to raise and analyze representations present in the work that promote the relationship between memory and catastrophe. The work exposes how Native memory is present in the new generation known as Urban Natives. Individuals are known as hybrid subjects, because at the same time that they experience their roots they also share the knowledge of the white man's experiences, highlighting the role of the Cities, the dominant society in making the indigenous a subject without their ancestry as it makes them insert more and more into a new reality, this is the catastrophic effect found in the narrative. Such aspects, present in this Orange's narrative, lead us to propose the category of Catastrophic Memory, as a possible tool in the literary field. To account for this argumentation we seek theoretical support from authors such as Michael Pollak (1989), Maurice Halbwachs (1990), Márcio Seligmann-Silva (2000), and Tânia Sarmiento-Pantoja (2014).

Keywords: Catastrophe. Memory. Native literature. Catastrophic memory.

RESUMO: Este estudo propõe uma abordagem sobre o conceito de catástrofe no interior de um corpus de literatura de autoria indígena. Para isso, utilizamos a obra *There There*, de Tommy Orange (2018), indígena estadunidense pertencente às tribos Cheyenne e Arapaho de Oklahoma, a fim de levantar e analisar representações presentes na obra que promovam a

¹ Trabalho de conclusão de curso, orientado pelo(a) Prof. Dr. Ana Lília Carvalho Rocha, apresentado à banca examinadora no dia 07 de dezembro de 2022.

² Discente do curso de Letras Língua Inglesa. Faculdade de Línguas Estrangeiras (FALEST). Universidade Federal do Pará, campus Bragança. Email: jenniferww50@hotmail.com

relação entre a memória e a catástrofe. A obra expõe como a memória nativa está presente na nova geração conhecida como Indígenas Urbanos. Indivíduos conhecidos como sujeitos híbridos, porque ao mesmo tempo em que vivenciam suas raízes também partilham dos conhecimentos das vivências do homem branco, destacando o papel das Cidades, da sociedade dominante em fazer do indígena um sujeito sem suas ancestralidades na medida em que o faz se inserir mais e mais em uma nova realidade, esse é o efeito catastrófico encontrado na narrativa. Tais aspectos, presentes nesta narrativa de Orange, nos levam a propor a categoria Memória Catastrófica, como uma ferramenta possível no campo literário. Para dar conta desta argumentação buscamos apoio teórico em autores como Michael Pollak (1989), Maurice Halbwachs (1990), Márcio Seligmann-Silva (2000) e Tânia Sarmiento-Pantoja (2014).

Palavras-chave: Catástrofe. Memória. Literatura nativa. Memória catastrófica.

INTRODUCTION

This work is the result of discussions and research carried out through participation in two research projects that work with the theme of resistance - Configurations of Resistance in Contemporary Anglophone Narratives - CRENAC oriented by professor Dr. Ana Lília Carvalho Rocha, and *Configurações do Testemunho em Narrativas Indigenistas Brasileiras* oriented by professor Dr. Tânia Maria Pereira Sarmiento-Pantoja.

The participation in CRENAC and *Configurações do Testemunho em Narrativas Indigenistas Brasileiras* made it possible to create the study about catastrophic theory in the scope of Native literature, as we can see, bringing the importance to explore this type of work. With this, it is important to highlight that the contribution and relevance of this work is to explore and show native resistance through literature.

Thus, the role of literature is precisely to make and give voice, to be a starting point for the non-forgetfulness of memory and history. Society has gone through great changes over the years, through great atrocities, genocides, massacres, and wars. The 20th century is a result of the various forms of resistance present through the testimonies, mainly, the testimonies coming from the Shoah (SARMENTO-PANTOJA, 2014). The various forms of annihilation of the being have changed over time, killing is no longer an option but seeking to break a part that is even greater, the annihilation through social and historical memory.

The literary work *There There* by the indigenous writer Tommy Orange addresses discussions about the new indigenous generations, and consequently, their confluence. When we read the word confluence what we have in mind is a term used in the studies of hydrology, in other words, when two rivers set off on a common path. In the literary field, its conceptualization is no different, as clarified by Orison Marden Bandeira de Melo Júnior in *Narrativas de confluência e a representação de vozes marginalizadas*, in his interpretation of the work by Antonio Luciano de Andrade Tosta, Melo Júnior (2021) understands a confluence narrative as works that approach and connect the past and the present, that is, when two spheres come together into one. Therefore, this dialogue would build a union between past and present, bringing the existing intercultural concepts in the meantime:

Confluence, however, as the author warns, is not to be understood as a harmonious contract of cultures; rather, the term refers to conflictual relations in which the struggle for power is intensified by social markers of difference, such as race, ethnicity, and class. [...] Confluence narratives are a subgenre of historical novels that examine national identities of American nations based on one or more of their cultural encounters" (p. 1)3; Confluence narratives revisit and reassess official histories [...]. They emphasize the participation and contributions of marginalized racial and ethnic groups in the Americas, revealing that race and ethnicity are central to understanding the construction of national identity in the region (TOSTA apud JÚNIOR, 2021).³

Such narratives, as Junior (2021) emphasizes, fit into the reconstruction of the past and existing gaps in memory. As well, works of confluence narratives often exhibit versions of history that have been hidden and repressed by a social elite who "traditionally controlled history itself." (TOSTA, 2016).

In Orange's narrative (2018) this paradigm is broken by giving prominence to the native voice. There are twelve different stories with different experiences departing for the same purpose, the event that will bring together all the peoples and indigenous people of Oklahoma City, in the United States, the well-known Powwow⁴. In other words, different identities and cultures in the midst of a national cultural meeting of American Indians.

Tommy Orange innovates bringing and giving voice to their identities and ancestry, besides deepening the reflection on memory and its relation with the catastrophic effect, as

³ Confluência, no entanto, como adverte o autor, não deve ser compreendida como um contrato harmonioso de culturas; pelo contrário, o termo se refere a relações de conflito em que a luta pelo poder é intensificada pelos marcadores sociais de diferença, como raça, etnia e classe. [...] Narrativas de confluência são um subgênero dos romances históricos que examinam identidades nacionais de nações americanas com base em um ou mais de seus encontros culturais" (p. 1)3 ; Narrativas de confluência revisitam e reavaliam histórias oficiais [...]. Elas enfatizam a participação e as contribuições de grupos raciais e étnicos marginalizados nas Américas, revelando que raça e etnia são fundamentais para o entendimento da construção de uma identidade nacional na região (TOSTA apud JÚNIOR, 2021).

⁴ Powwow is a celebration of American Native culture in which people from diverse nations gather for the purpose of dancing, singing, and honoring the traditions of their ancestors.

primordial resources for the composition of his narrative, since among the twelve protagonists there is one in which we observe an amnesic recomposition punctually associated with the effects of the catastrophe on the community of which they are part of, this protagonist is Tony Loneman. Therefore, for this study, exemplifying the catastrophic event and its relationship with memory we showed two characters, Tony Loneman and Dene Oxendene, that exemplification clearly these events in Orange's narrative. The second character presents us with his voracious search for memory, with a reflection on the new generations, memory - especially as a heritage of knowledge - becomes forgotten due to the great contact of the indigenous community between the two worlds that permeate it, the native world and the world of the dominant society. According to Orange:

Urban Indians were the generation born in the city. We've been moving for a long time, but the land moves with you like a memory. An Urban Indian belongs to the city, and cities belong to the earth. Everything here is formed in relation to every other living and nonliving thing from the earth. All our relations (ORANGE, 2018, p. 15).

Thus, a new look and a new characteristic are applied to this new generation. Indians who, as a result of the forms of catastrophe accumulated during the existence of their community, become more and more part of non-indigenous society and, therefore, of white man's culture. In other words, indigenous identity is at great risk of being diluted in the face of the possibility of acculturation, a condition that in itself is also catastrophic. However, as Orange's narrative highlights, this condition can be displaced or even overcome as small movements of resistance persist. The character Dene Oxendene himself is an example of this *rexistence*⁵.

The question remains: How is a catastrophic narrative linked to memory? Memory can be intrinsically linked to and affected by a catastrophic event. Memory can be forgotten and silenced, but it can also be transformed, thus, as Michael Pollak (1989) presents in his article *Memória, Esquecimento, Silêncio*, memory is a social resource in which the unsaid and the said have total relevance to its construction, having also its importance in the traces of collective or individual memory, traces that become significant, both personally and as a group.

Especially when the tracks, many times forgotten or ignored, reveal different interpretations from the official one or even the one we are used to hearing - after all, social facts are not simply observable "things", as Dürkheim wanted, but phenomena that harbor a dynamic that can hardly be mathematized, that is, easily

⁵ *Rexistence* is a term used in the doctoral thesis entitled "POÉTICAS DA REXISTÊNCIA: Escrituras indígenas de autoria de mulheres potiguara (Brasil) e mapuche (Chile)" by professor Dr. Larissa Fontinele, who rightly points to a new terminology for the word resistance as not only resisting but also existing.

interpreted by the positivist bias. On the contrary, it is a process that demands the hard work of interpreting the existing worlds and underworlds, the subterfuges, the forgetfulness, the lies, the half-truths, the silences, the anguishes, and pleasures (PAIVA, 2011, p. 04).⁶

In the article *A memória da catástrofe como unificadora do Acontecimento e da Experiência: um exame da narrativa testemunhal de Bruno Bettelheim em Revisitando Dachau* by Fabiana de Souza Frederico and Luana de Oliveira, the authors address precisely this transformation but turning their analysis to the twentieth century, known as the century of barbarism "There is a hegemonic interpretation of the twentieth century that, permeated by a fatalistic historical reading, qualifies it as a century of catastrophes. [...] civilization and progress for the nineteenth century; barbarism and catastrophe for the twentieth century" (FREDERICO; OLIVEIRA, 2011, p. 325)⁷. As we can see, catastrophe plays a relevant role in this process, which is what we intend to investigate. Memory is resistance and in *There There* we intend to see the power of the catastrophe in the process of the register memory.

For this, we used authors who address the conception of memory as Michael Pollak (1989) and Maurice Halbwachs (1990), and catastrophe concept from Tânia Sarmiento-Pantoja (2014). With this, we seek to perceive these elements of catastrophic memory present in Orange's narrative, using two characters that best exemplify this relationship: Tony Loneman and Dene Oxendene.

This way, the research has the following criteria for its analysis: a discussion about the theoretical contribution, and the analysis of the theoretical material along with Orange's (2018) work.

LITERATURE REVIEW

The word "resistance" comes from the Latin *resistentia* which means "make a stand against, oppose" (ONLINE ETYMOLOGY DICTIONARY, 2021), in other words, the power of resisting. In the world of literature, this term is not just a word, but a way to continue

⁶ Principalmente quando os rastros, muitas vezes esquecidos ou ignorados, revelam interpretações distintas da oficial ou mesmo da que se acostuma ouvir – afinal, os fatos sociais não são simplesmente “coisas” observáveis, como queria Dürkheim, mas são fenômenos que abrigam uma dinâmica dificilmente matematizável, isto é, facilmente interpretada pelo viés positivista. Pelo contrário, é um processo que demanda o trabalho árduo de interpretação dos mundos existentes e dos submundos, dos subterfúgios, dos esquecimentos, das mentiras, das meio-verdades, dos silêncios, das angústias e dos prazeres (PAIVA, 2011, p. 04).

⁷ Há uma interpretação hegemônica sobre o século XX que, permeada por uma leitura histórica fatalista, o qualifica como um século de catástrofes. [...] civilização e progresso para o século XIX; barbárie e catástrofe para o século XX (FREDERICO; OLIVEIRA, 2011, p. 325).

existing. Native Literature is a form of fighting against a society that insists on not giving a voice to this minority. This is apparent when we read some books written by native writers such as Kaká Werá Jecupe, Daniel Munduruku, and Tommy Orange. The last one is a native American writer, and his book *There There*, which will be analyzed in this article.

We intend to analyze two concepts and how they are related, memory and catastrophe, proposing another concept through them, the catastrophic memory. As Maurice Halbwachs (1990) highlights in his book entitled *Collective Memory*, the individual is constituted by three types of memory - individual, collective, and historical memory - all three go together, and none is separate from the other. What the author presents us with is that if there is no memory, consequently, no history. Societies remain in constant metamorphosis, changes that arise through a causative effect. In this case, the transformations in indigenous society are in the fact that the dominant society seeks to impose its limits on the other's culture. Today, in the United States, such native societies live and remain on reservations established by the government (NATIONAL GEOGRAPHIC SOCIETY, 2022). With the beginning of colonization in North America, the natives gradually lost their identities and culture, and consequently, their memory.

There There is a narrative that frames the forgotten indigenous voices within their country's history, the work seeks to expose how this (re)construction of native memory and identity can still be present in the new generation known as Urban Indians.

With this, one can understand that Orange traces a narrative in search of memory, the search for the native identity, and the permanence of traditions and customs. The fiction follows the story of twelve characters whose lives are intertwined. Like spider webs "spiders carry miles of web inside their bodies, miles of stories, miles of stories, miles of home" (ORANGE, 2018). Each seeks in some way to keep alive the native culture and this is noticeable in each one. Tommy Orange innovates bringing a set of American voices and their experiences within this new setting, the cities.

The question remains: How is the catastrophic narrative connected with memory? Memory is intrinsically linked to and affected by the catastrophic event. It can be forgotten and silenced, but it can also be transformed. Thus, as Michael Pollak (1989) said in his article *Memória, Esquecimento, Silenciamento* memory is a social resource in which the said and the unsaid have total relevance to its construction, and also has its importance in the traces of collective or individual memory, traces that become significant, both personally as in a group.

With this, the concept of catastrophe according to Márcio Seligmann-Silva (2000) is intertwined with a traumatic event, with shock. That is, an abrupt rupture capable of causing an extreme shock. The catastrophe is presented here by human actions/interventions, which generate wars, destruction, genocides, and massacres. As Tânia Sarmiento-Pantoja (2014, p. 167) clarifies, it "arouses by the exception of the common, a broken experience"⁸, in narratives it stands out by the presence of historical events through the resource of fictionalization of such episodes. Thus, "suffering is usually privileged in this type of narrative, providing the receiver with poignant moments capable of attracting his sympathy towards the characters" (SARMENTO-PANTOJA, 2014, p. 168).⁹

in narratives of the catastrophe, a redirection or refunctionalization of these devices due to two aspects: the presence of the taint causing the trauma, the shock, and, consequently, a whole process of discontinuity of the customary and the everyday [...] The second aspect is at the origin of the distancing (SARMENTO-PANTOJA, 2014, p. 169).¹⁰

The power of catastrophe allows us to experience these episodes even more, even if they come in a more succinct form and are little reported. However, they forget the great contribution of these people to the nation and the formation of Brazilian society, and not only Brazilian society, but in this case to all societies. It should be noted that when addressing such a theme, it also fits the proposal of Orange (2018), where there are North American people forgotten and invisible to society, that is, silenced.

This work proposes to analyze the representations that promote the relationship between memory and catastrophe presented in *There There* by Tommy Orange.

METHODOLOGY

The research is identified as bibliographical, within a study characterized as comparative literature by approaching a work within the critical literary and extra-literary parameters, thus, this research considers two essential premises of this practice: analysis of

⁸ "suscita pela exceção do comum, uma experiência partida" (SARMENTO-PANTOJA, 2014, p. 168).

⁹ "o sofrimento costuma ser privilegiado nesse tipo de narrativa, proporcionando ao receptor, momentos pungentes, capazes de atrair sua simpatia em relação aos personagens" (SARMENTO-PANTOJA, 2014, p. 168).

¹⁰ Em narrativas da catástrofe, um redirecionamento ou refuncionalização desses dispositivos em função de dois aspectos: a presença da mácula causadora do trauma, do choque e, conseqüentemente, de todo um processo de descontinuidade do costumeiro e do cotidiano [...] O segundo aspecto está na origem do distanciamento (SARMENTO-PANTOJA, 2014, p. 169).

the literary material and theoretical contributions using two characters that clarify the aim purposed (Tony Loneman and Dene Oxendene); as well as, the possibility of critical analysis of the subject. In this sense this work has in view a theoretical-critical immersion based on the study of the catastrophe and the memory, in this form, we intend to propose Catastrophic Memory as a possible case in the literature studies/field. This way, we use the studies of Michael Pollak (1989) and Maurice Halbwach (1993) about memory. In this way, we consider the studies on Catastrophe in the works of Márcio Seligmann-Silva (2000) and Tânia Sarmiento-Pantoja (2014).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

TO RESIST AND EXIST: THE CATASTROPHE AND ITS RELATIONSHIP IN THE METAMORPHOSIS OF THE NATIVE IN *THERE THERE*

Catastrophe is a strong word with great significance. Of Greek origin *katastrophe* (from kata-, "down", and *strophein*, "to turn") nomenclature is in the personification of a disastrous event, an element that causes death and destruction. For Márcio Seligmann-Silva (2000) it is also "life turned inside out". Catastrophe is commonly associated with events due to natural causes (earthquakes, tsunamis, volcanism, etc), but it can also arise due to human and social causes (armed conflicts, persecution of certain groups, genocide, etc).

Therefore, as we read in *Catástrofe: manual do usuário* by Tânia Sarmiento-Pantoja (2014), the approach to the catastrophic concept is also linked to the effect of barbarism, in other words, to think catastrophe with elements that are also present in barbarism, being barbarism everything that evokes what is too inhuman and extreme and catastrophe being the process of exception. Within this analytical aspect for a better understanding of the catastrophic concept, Sarmiento-Pantoja (2014) developed some indispensable topics to understand this process, there are: the Exception, the Stripping, the Annihilation, and the Survival. For this explanation of the catastrophic effect, it is indispensable to approach Eric Hobsbawm's (2013) studies on barbarism. Thus, what we also find within this analysis is the essay "*Barbárie: um guia para o usuário*", by Eric Hobsbawm (2013), to think not about "how to be barbarian, but fundamentally to think about the reason of the rise of Barbarism" (SARMENTO-PANTOJA, 2014, p. 161).¹¹

¹¹ "como ser bárbaro, mas fundamentalmente pensar nos porquês da ascensão da Barbárie".

It is indispensable to think of the catastrophe with elements that also belong to barbarism. In this way, the exception: the principle of turning what is illegal into a legal form and use, the use of tools of control as forms of repressive practices, the barbaric character; Stripping: taking away from the individual his or her rights, making them mere beings that are not even equal to animals. It is to diminish the subject and destroy him little by little, removing all his identity, thus, the stripping is classified as the radical alteration of the identity, moving on to the last stage of the deconfiguration of the physical body, to then reaching; Annihilation: the presence of the torture machines, and the evidence of death; and Survival: surviving an event of great trauma that configures the category of testimony, what is left but to testify. Thus, what will occur is the transformation of the individual into a survivor, survival refers to the one who did not surrender to the machines of torture and death. Being now, the witness of the catastrophic experience, he has not succumbed to torture and death because he has not gone through the total experience of annihilation. To go through the total experience of annihilation is to die, those who have died have no way to bear witness (SARMENTO-PANTOJA, 2014).

Thus, catastrophe contains within itself elements of barbarism that make us perceive and understand it as a "civilized barbarism" used as a civilizing process, that is, there is the use of violence in a conscious way through the State, which starts to have the monopoly and centralization of power. What we emphasize in this methodology is precisely what Eric Hobsbawm (2013) comes to discuss about barbarism in *Barbárie: Manual do Usuário*, i.e., that barbaric behavior gained great ascendancy during the 20th century, particularly with the culmination of the two World Wars, marked by the growth of genocides, massacres, and persecutions. Effects evident in the occurrence of the states of exception that became fundamental in this process. As he highlights, the 20th century may not be the century that killed the most, but it was the century that knew how to forge the means to kill (HOBSAWM, 2013).

barbarism was on the rise for most of the 20th century, and there is no indication that this growth is at an end. In this context, I take "barbarism" to mean two things. First, the breakdown and collapse of the systems of rules and moral behavior by which all societies control relations among their members and, to a lesser extent, between their members and those of other societies (HOBSAWM, 2013, p. 229).¹²

¹² a barbárie esteve em crescimento durante a maior parte do século XX, e não há nenhum indício de que esse crescimento esteja no fim. Nesse contexto, entendo que "barbárie" signifique duas coisas. Primeiro, a ruptura e colapso dos sistemas de regras e comportamento moral pelos quais todas as sociedades controlam as relações entre seus membros e, em menor extensão, entre seus membros e os de outras sociedades (HOBSAWM, 2013, p. 229).

Thus, the 20th century may not be the one that killed the most, but it is the one that knew how to use the most forms of annihilation. But is society trying to forget the 20th century? There is no right answer to this question, yet, through the atrocities experienced once again and neglected by political and social powers, it is clear that there is a regression of the 21st century to its predecessor, the 20th century, a century in which wars, genocides, and massacres were great evidence.

In this way, the catastrophic power allows us to experience even more of these episodes even if they come in a more succinct form and are so little reported, when we talk about this what comes to mind is precisely the indigenous genocides, a people that for the dominant society has no importance whatsoever. However, they forget the great contribution of these people to the nation and to the formation of Brazilian society, and not only Brazilian society, but in this case to all societies. It is worth mentioning that when addressing such a theme, it also fits in Orange's (2018) proposal, where there are North American people forgotten and invisible to society.

If we refer to the second sense of the word "barbaric"-cruel, inhumane acts, the deliberate production of suffering and the deliberate killing of noncombatants (in particular, children)-no century in history has known manifestations of barbarism as extensive, as massive, and as systematic as the 20th century. Certainly, human history is rich in barbaric acts, committed by both "civilized" nations [...]. Modern history, after the conquest of the Americas, seems like a succession of such acts: the massacre of the indigenous people of the Americas, the slave trade, the colonial wars. Karl Marx was one of the fiercest critics of these kinds of evil and destructive practices of modernity, which for him are associated with the needs of capital accumulation. In *Capital*, especially in the chapter on primitive accumulation, one finds a radical critique of the horrors of colonial expansion: the enslavement or extermination of indigenous people, the wars of conquest, the trafficking of black people (LÖWY, 2010, s.p.).¹³

Here we find what Orange (2018) presents in its first pages, *The Indian Head*¹⁴, the head of a Native person was portrayed and broadcast on all American TVs after the close of

¹³ Se nós nos referimos ao segundo sentido da palavra "bárbaro" -atos cruéis, desumanos, a produção deliberada de sofrimento e a morte deliberada de não-combatentes (em particular, crianças)- nenhum século na história conheceu manifestações de barbárie tão extensas, tão massivas e tão sistemáticas quanto o século XX. Certamente, a história humana é rica em atos bárbaros, cometidos tanto pelas nações "civilizadas" [...]. A história moderna, depois da conquista das Américas, parece uma sucessão de atos desse gênero: o massacre de indígenas das Américas, o tráfico negreiro, as guerras coloniais. Trata-se de uma barbárie "civilizada", isto é, conduzida pelos impérios coloniais economicamente mais avançados [...] Karl Marx era um dos críticos mais ferozes desses tipos de práticas maléficas e destruidoras da modernidade, que para ele estão associadas às necessidades de acumulação do capital. Em *O Capital*, especialmente no capítulo sobre a acumulação primitiva, encontra-se uma crítica radical dos horrores da expansão colonial: a escravização ou o extermínio dos indígenas, as guerras de conquista, o tráfico de negros (LÖWY, 2010, s.p.).

¹⁴ The term Indian within Tommy Orange's narrative is still used, therefore, such terminology within this article, taking into consideration that they will occur only in parts where the author himself quotes.

all programs, this was called the Indian Head Standardization Test. The head of a native in the crosshairs of a rifle. In other words, what we can perceive is a manifestation of existing power, to be in the sights of a gun means to be at all times kept under existing orders, any deviation classifies you as an annihilation. As highlighted in the previous quote, territorial expansions demonstrate this constant search for power.

In 1621, colonists invited Massasoit, the chief of the Wampanoags, to a feast after a recent land deal. Massasoit came with ninety of his men. *That* meal is why we still eat a meal together in November. Celebrate it as a nation. But that one wasn't a Thanksgiving meal. It was a land-deal meal. Two years later, there was another, similar meal meant to symbolize eternal friendship. Two hundred Indians dropped dead that night from an unknown poison (ORANGE, 2018, p. 8).

The colonization period of the United States allows us to visualize the successful massacres, or rather, the expansion and civilization process, after all, making the Indians leave for the cities was one more way to make them disappear, assimilate and become more and more with the dominant society, continuing as Orange (2018) highlights, the culmination of a genocidal campaign of more than five hundred years. However, even with the culmination of this genocidal campaign, the permanence of the natives in the cities did not transform them, but became them, to put it in another way, "an Urban Indian belongs to the city and cities belong to the Earth " (ORANGE, 2018, p. 15).

The existence and resistance through the creation of Indigenous Centers, bringing back the songs, dances, and handcrafts, in short, and a whole ancestral history. The work presents forms of resistance, and among these forms is the use of the native memory present in the new generation known as Urban Indians. Individuals are known as hybrid subjects, because at the same time that they experience their roots they also share the knowledge of the experiences of the white man, in this way the dominant society seeks to make the indigenous a subject without their ancestry through their social insertion, thus, if there is no ancestral knowledge there is no memory. As the author points out, everything belongs to the Earth, it has what we know as memory, the memory that is fading away amidst a new reality experienced by everyone in the narrative. The narrative presents the questions that the new generations ask themselves as they think they do not belong and do not have a native identity, twelve stories that go toward the same end, the meeting at the Powwow in Oklahoma City, in the United States. All of them are like a river full of branches but they find their end at only one common point. As Maurício Negro (2019) points out in the book's preface *Nós: uma antologia de literatura indígena*:

Most of the population now lives almost entirely in the cities. In addition, at least 40% of indigenous people also survive outside their villages of origin, seeking to manage the codes and demands of the dominant society. They struggle to be accepted and respected for their ancestral roots (MINÁPOTY et al, 2019, p. 10).¹⁵

Societies, as Maurício Negro (2013) points out, remain in constant metamorphosis, changes that arise through a causative effect. In this case, the transformations in indigenous societies are in the fact that the dominant society seeks to impose its limits on the other's culture. Today, in the United States, such native societies live and remain on reservations established by the government. With the beginning of colonization in North America, the natives gradually lost their identities and cultures, and consequently, their memory. However, it is worth noting that some resisted the impositions of the colonizers by making the indigenous an individual in their likeness.

When we explore native literature, we explore a way to resist and persist, again highlighting what Maurício Negro discusses about this subject "The so-called indigenous literature carries this deep desire to reattach and strengthen the ties between us all, of an ancient wisdom whose echoes are still out there asking for reinforcement in words and images" (MINÁPOTY et al, 2019, p. 11)¹⁶.

However, *There There* proposes this decolonization, bringing literature filled with information pertinent to society. To think and remember the origin is to maintain the old and future generations. As the Brazilian indigenous writer Daniel Munduruku explains in his commentary about the book *Nós: uma antologia de literatura indígena* (2019), indigenous societies are moved by the magic of myths; the mystery of things lies in them, of how we live, and of what we have. After all, what matters is the origin: the heart of the mystery to which they will also go and return. To feel all this it is necessary to learn to contemplate and read the silence that inhabits each being and at the same time be the silence.

There There contemplates us with this perspective, but also with the suspension of silence about the identity itself: after all, am I a native? A question made by the youngest characters in the narrative, bringing up why they do not feel they belong to a native society and at the same time the fight for this identity, a fight elaborated by the persistence in existing and keeping traditions alive. A fight made through the register of memory.

¹⁵ A maioria da população vive hoje quase integralmente nas cidades. Além disso, pelo menos 40% dos indígenas também sobrevivem fora de suas aldeias de origem, buscando manejar os códigos e as demandas da sociedade dominante. Lutam para ser aceitos e respeitados pelas suas raízes ancestrais (MINÁPOTY et al, 2019, p. 10).

¹⁶ A chamada literatura indígena carrega esse desejo profundo de reatar e fortalecer os laços entre todos nós, de uma sabedoria antiga, cujos ecos ainda estão por aí pedindo reforço em palavras e imagens (MINÁPOTY et al, 2019, p. 11).

Thus, when we think about the effect of forgetting and silencing, what comes to mind is precisely what Pollak (1989) addresses in his work entitled *Memory, Forgetting, Silence* about these three pillars that become essential to the analysis of catastrophic memory, after all, catastrophic memory is that in which there is a change resulting from experiences, transforming it into memory beyond the individual, collective, and historical.

In his analysis of collective memory, Maurice Halbwachs emphasizes the strength of the different reference points that structure our memory and insert it into the memory of the collectivity to which we belong. These obviously include monuments, the places of memory analyzed by Pierre Nora, the architectural heritage and its style, which accompany us throughout our lives, landscapes, dates and historical figures whose importance we are constantly reminded of, traditions and customs, certain rules of interaction, folklore, and music, and, why not, culinary traditions. In the Durkheimian methodological tradition, which consists in treating social facts as things, it becomes possible to take these different reference points as empirical indicators of the collective memory of a given group, a structured memory with its hierarchies and classifications, a memory also that, by defining what is common to a given group and what differentiates it from others, grounds and reinforces feelings of belonging and socio-cultural boundaries (POLLAK, 1989, p. 3).¹⁷

Thus, Pollak (1989) brings in his study the approach of Maurice Halbwachs (1990) and the Durkheimian approach. According to Halbwachs (1990) memory can be collective, that which is created in a social environment, that is, everyone shares something in common, but it is also individual because even though it is a collective memory it is individual to the extent that only the subject experiences and feels certain situations. However, memory is also historical. It is worth pointing out that this memory that was mentioned encompasses what we know as ancestral memory, in other words, the memory of a nation. Therefore, the category of memory now has not only three points of debate but also a fourth, which seeks to expose the effects experienced by this change of memory that is seen and used differently, it is worth mentioning that often after this effect of the catastrophic event what we can see in the society involved is precisely a decrease, and consequently, a forgetfulness of experiences, the individual who goes through a traumatic effect does not want to relive it or even remember it,

¹⁷ Em sua análise da memória coletiva, Maurice Halbwachs enfatiza a força dos diferentes pontos de referência que estruturam nossa memória e que a inserem na memória da coletividade a que pertencemos. Entre eles incluem-se evidentemente os monumentos, esses lugares da memória analisados por Pierre Nora, o patrimônio arquitetônico e seu estilo, que nos acompanham por toda a nossa vida, as paisagens, as datas e personagens históricas de cuja importância somos incessantemente lembrados, as tradições e costumes, certas regras de interação, o folclore e a música, e, por que não, as tradições culinárias. Na tradição metodológica durkheimiana, que consiste em tratar fatos sociais como coisas, torna-se possível tomar esses diferentes pontos de referência como indicadores empíricos da memória coletiva de um determinado grupo, uma memória estruturada com suas hierarquias e classificações, uma memória também que, ao definir o que é comum a um determinado grupo e o que diferencia dos outros, fundamenta e reforça os sentimentos de pertencimento e as fronteiras sócio-culturais (POLLAK, 1989, p. 3).

but also leaving to the importance of witnessing to the effect of not forgetting. The catastrophic memory is the memory that comes from the catastrophic process, in this way, it is a memory that changes over time, and within the indigenous culture is the forgetting of traditions, these traditions lose space to another one in which the individuals are inserted, in this case, it is a cultural, traditional and social annihilation. As highlighted in *There There* by the character Dene Oxendene, his perception of this home is that the changes were noticeable not only to those who experienced it (the elders) but to the new generations who do not see themselves as natives.

"There is no there there," he says, in a sort of whisper, with a pastiche of an open-mouthed grin that Dene wants to punch. Dene wants to tell him that he has already researched the quote in its original context, in everyone's Autobiography and found that it was talking about how the place where he had grown up in Oakland had changed so much, that so much progress had happened there, that that there of his childhood, that there that was there, had disappeared, there was no longer a there. Dene wants to tell him that this is what happened to the Natives, and wants to explain that they are no longer the same, that Dene is Native, born and raised in Oakland, from Oakland. [...] This is an inexistent place. I hadn't read Gertrude Stein beyond that quote. But for Native people in this country, throughout the Americas, progress has covered everything up, buried ancestral lands, glass and concrete, and steel and metal, covering non-returnable memory. There is no there there (ORANGE, 2018, p. 44).

There There represented this non-existent *home*, in other words, the inexistence of the memory caused by the catastrophic effects. However, it is in the Powwow, a traditional event of the Native American culture, that there will be this rediscovery of home, after all, it is a celebration made with the intention of integration between the existing groups through music.

And another question that surges is: How is the catastrophic memory portrayed in the narrative? This memory is represented through the characters present in the literary work, among them the ones we mentioned at the beginning of this work, Tony Loneman and Dene Oxendene. Loneman will not miss the big event, but initially, his main goal is not to meet again but to make a robbery of the Great Oakland Powwow. His story begins with a sense of the non-existence of native memory, and the effects of the process of over five hundred years. That is the effect of a catastrophic process, not identifying or feeling a sense of belonging to a society. This destruction allowed him to see no value in ancestral teachings, see by him as something meaningless. Once, for Dene Oxendene his perception is different, the Great Event is a chance to honor the memory of his uncle. He thinks about a past that is non-existent for himself but should not be for the next generations. To think about the record of memory is to understand that everything we are and have come from it, and that in it we must remain, is to elucidate utmost importance to "the memory of the nation." As highlighted,

There There is a book about human beings who have been forced into a stereotypical, anachronistic, artificial reality; about Natives who grew up watching their fellow human beings being slaughtered by John Wayne's revolver, saved by Kevin Costner's dancing and played by an Italian actor named Iron Eyes Cody; about the difficulty of building a future when there is no past (EDITORA ROCCO, 2018).

The non-existent past and the various forms of annihilation of the being have changed over time, killing is no longer an option but rather seeking to break a part that is even greater, annihilation through memory. As Halbwachs (1990) points out, the individual is made up of three types of memory - individual, collective, and historical memory - all three go together, and none is separate from the other. The author presents us with that if there is no memory, then there is no history. However, a new memory is presented here, the catastrophic memory, constituted through the consequences of a trauma, it is worth noting:

Catastrophe is, by definition, an event that causes trauma, another Greek word, meaning "injury." "Trauma" derives from an Indo-European root with two meanings: "rubbing, grinding, piercing"; but also "supplanting," or "passing through." In this contradiction - a thing that grinds, pierces, but which, at the same time, is what makes us supplant it, is already revealed, once again, the paradox of catastrophic experience, __ which for this very reason does not allow itself to be caught by simple forms of narrative (SELIGMANN-SILVA, 2000, p. 8).¹⁸

All these effects can be perceived within a corpus of literature of indigenous authorship. Thinking about catastrophic memory is to imagine a conceptualization beyond a whole, everything is part of memory, but not everything becomes a memory, for an individual in the midst of so many civilization processes, this becomes a way of disappearance, the catastrophe acts as a social weapon for absorption, the constructed memory becomes that of the other and no longer that of the native. There is a rupture of events, the new generations as clarified by Orange (2018) search for the gaps and lines left in their pasts, Tony Loneman and Dene Oxendene, are characters in constant search for the unknown-known. Loneman feels indigenous on his deathbed as he feels his ancestral roots, and Dene realizes herself indigenous as only the record of the unlived becomes of greater importance due to it being a memory and part of her uncle's work.

There There by Tommy Orange takes us to a new perspective and social reality of the old and new generations, the latter being his point of discovery and writing for this new

¹⁸ A catástrofe é, por definição, um evento que provoca um trauma, outra palavra grega, que quer dizer "ferimento". "Trauma" deriva de uma raiz indo-européia com dois sentidos: "friccionar, triturar, perfurar"; mas também "suplantar", "passar através". Nesta contradição - uma coisa que tritura, perfura, mas que, ao mesmo tempo, é o que nos faz suplantá-la, já se revela, mais uma vez, o paradoxo da experiência catastrófica, __ que por isso mesmo não se deixa apanhar por formas simples de narrativa (SELIGMANN-SILVA, 2000, p. 8).

reality, after all, as an indigenous person belonging to this new generation, what the author presents us is not only his own but also the reality of many. For this, we can call it a narrative about *Rexistence*, not only resisting but also existing. It is important to note that the category Catastrophic Memory refers to this process of social erasure through the resource of memory, with memory being the bridge for the permanence of the culture and traditions of the original peoples. Thus, the catastrophe is the process of a new memory arising from catastrophic events that transform and reshape the new generation and its knowledge about the cultural issues of its people.

The article intended to show through a bibliographical study, through conceptual guidelines, analyze the relationship between catastrophe and memory, and investigate both concepts. Seeking to understand the representations present in the narrative *There There* from Tommy Orange. Thus, the findings were as follows: about the difficulty in idealizing a future when there is no past; the inexistence or good part of historical memory; the permanence of a genocidal campaign of more than five hundred years that has its achievement implemented in the majority of indigenous societies of the current generations, the social silencing; an era in which the great transformations had their effect on the original peoples - to equalize with the other, the most effective form of elimination - but still, resistance arises/emerges.

FINAL CONSIDERATIONS

In short, resistance starts from the etymology of the word, which comes from the Latin *resistantia* and has its meaning "to stand firm", it will also arise from the same origin the word exist from the Latin *existĕre*, and means "to have existence; to subsist; to last". Both words are in what we can call *Rexistence*, in other words, to resist and to exist. The role of literature is precisely in making, giving voice to, and being a starting point for not forgetting memory and history, but also for an analysis of the current manifestations of the fight for permanence.

Tommy Orange and other indigenous writers present their stories and struggles through literature, after all, it is the literature of resistance. However, from another perspective of resistance, that of survival through a genocidal manifestation of more than five hundred years of American history, such manifestation has inculcated the catastrophic era throughout the period of the native peoples' existence until the present moment, the era of great

transformations in which to equal the other is the most effective form of elimination. Therefore, catastrophic memory is the loss and forgetting of traditions and culture is the annihilation of society through the loss of memory, in other words, catastrophic memory starts from social silencing.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

First of all, I would like to thank my family, my mother Maria Cherli Santos and my father Sivaldo Oliveira, who were with me during my entire process. Also, my friends who supported me during these four years of the course have been by my side. I am also extremely grateful to the project Configurations of Resistance in Contemporary Anglophone Narratives - CRENAC, coordinated by Professor Dr. Ana Lília Carvalho Rocha, and also to Professor Dr. Tânia Sarmiento-Pantoja for the opportunity to be part of her research project *Configurações do Testemunho em Narrativas Indigenistas Brasileiras*, it is essential to point out that this work was only possible through my participation in her project, as well as, in CRENAC.

REFERENCES

ALENCAR, Larissa Fontinele de. POÉTICAS DA “REXISTÊNCIA”: ESCRITURAS INDÍGENAS DE AUTORIA DE MULHERES POTIGUARA (BRASIL) E MAPUCHE (CHILE). 2022. Tese (Doutorado em Letras: Linguística e Teoria Literária) - Universidade Federal do Pará, 2022.

FREDRIGO, Fabiana de Souza; OLIVEIRA, Laura de. **A memória da catástrofe como unificadora do Acontecimento e da Experiência**: um exame da narrativa testemunhal de Bruno Bettelheim em Revisitando Dachau. Projeto História: Viagens, Viajantes e Deslocamentos, v. 42, 2011. Available in: <https://revistas.pucsp.br/index.php/revph/article/view/7993/5869>. Access on July 13th, 2022.

HOBSBAWM, Eric J. **Barbárie**: Manual do usuário. In: Sobre história. Tradução de Cid Knipel Moreira. São Paulo: Companhia das Letras, 2013.

HALBWACHS, Maurice. **Memória coletiva**. Tradução de Laurent Léon Schaffter. Editora Revista dos Tribunais Ltda, 1990.

JÚNIOR, Orison Marden Bandeira de Melo. **Narrativas de confluência e a representação de vozes marginalizadas**. Revista Letras Raras, Campina Grande, v. 10, n. 4, p. 237-244, dez. 2021.

LÁ não existe lá. Editora Rocco. 2018. Available in: <https://www.rocco.com.br/livro/la-nao-existe-la/#:~:text=L%C3%A1%20n%C3%A3o%20existe%20%C3%A1%20%C3%A9,chamado%20Iron%20Eyes%20Cody%3B%20sobre>. Access on Oct. 13th, 2022.

LÖWY, Michael. **Barbárie e modernidade no século XX**. Tradução de Alessandra Ceregatti. Revista EcoDebate, 2010. Available in: <https://www.ecodebate.com.br/2010/05/20/barbarie-e-modernidade-no-seculo-20-artigo-de-michael-lowy/>. Access on July 28th, 2022.

NATIONAL GEOGRAPHIC SOCIETY. **The United States Government's Relationship with Native Americans**. National Geographic, 2022. Available in: <https://education.nationalgeographic.org/resource/united-states-governments-relationship-native-americans>. Access on Sep. 14th, 2022.

NEGRO, Maurício. Nós. mas, afinal, nós quem?. In: MINÁPOTY, Lia et al. **Nós: uma antologia de literatura indígena**. São Paulo: Companhia das Letras, 2019, p. 9-11.

ORANGE, Tommy. **Lá não existe lá**. Tradução de Ismar Tirelli Neto. Rio de Janeiro: Rocco, 2018.

ORANGE, Tommy. **There There**. New York: Knopf Publishing Group, 2018.

PAIVA, Wilson Alves. **DO PATEO DO COLÉGIO AO PÁTIO DA ESCOLA: violência simbólica e violência de fato**. Revista Científica de Educação, [S. l.], v. 2, n. 1, p. 4–18, 2018. Available in: <https://seer.facmais.edu.br/rc/index.php/RCE/article/view/15>. Access on July 15th, 2022.

POLLAK, Michael. **Memória, Esquecimento, Silêncio**. Estudos Históricos. Rio de Janeiro, v. 2, n. 1, 1989, p. 3-15.

RESISTANCE. **Online Etymology Dictionary**, 2021. Available in: <https://www.etymonline.com/word/resistance>. Access on Oct. 18th, 2022.

SARMENTO-PANTOJA, Tânia. **Catástrofe: manual do usuário**. In: SARMENTO-PANTOJA, Augusto; UMBACH, Rosani. SARMENTO-PANTOJA, Tânia (Orgs.). **Estudos de Literatura e Resistência**. Campinas: Pontes Editores, 2014, p. 159-183.

SELIGMANN-SILVA, Márcio; NESTROVSKI, Arthur. **Catástrofe e representação: ensaios**. São Paulo : Escuta, 2000.

TOSTA, Antonio Luciano de Andrade. **Confluence Narratives: Ethnicity, History, and Nation-Making in the Americas**. Lewisburg, PA: Bucknell University Press, 2016.